IEEE 7007 Ontological Standard for Ethically Driven Robotics and Automation Systems

SA Ballot

Edson Prestes
IEEE 7007 - Ontological Standard for Ethically Driven Robotics and Automation Systems

Purpose: The standard establishes a set of definitions and their relationships that will enable the development of Robotics and Automation Systems in accordance with worldwide Ethics and Moral theories, with a particular emphasis on aligning the ethics and engineering communities to understand how to pragmatically design and implement these systems in unison.

Applications
- a guide for teaching ethical design;
- a reference by policy makers and governments to draft AI related policies;
- a common vocabulary to enable the communication among government agencies and other professional bodies around the world;
- a framework to create systems that can act ethically; and
- a foundation for the elaboration of other ethical compliance standards.

Stakeholders
Manufacturers, service and solution providers, equipment suppliers in the robotics and users.
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

Overview

MEC Submission : January, 4th
MEC Feedback : February, 10th

Legal Review Submission : ~ February, 10th
Legal Review Feedback : March, 4th
Legal Review 1st Resubmission : March, 10th
Legal Review 2nd Resubmission : April, 2nd

Request to initiate the Ballot : April, 12th
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

P7007/D1, April 2021
Draft Ontological Standard for Ethically Driven Robotics and Automation Systems

P7007™/D1
Draft Ontological Standard for Ethically Driven Robotics and Automation Systems

Developed by the
Standing Committee for Standards Activities
of the
IEEE Robotics and Automation Society

Approved <Date Approved>

IEEE SA Standards Board

Copyright © 2021 by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
Three Park Avenue
New York, New York 10016-5997, USA

All rights reserved.

This document is an unapproved draft of a proposed IEEE Standard. As such, this document is subject to change. USE AT YOUR OWN RISK! IEEE copyright statements SHALL NOT BE REMOVED from draft or approved IEEE standards, or modified in any way. Because this is an unapproved draft, this document must not be utilized for any conformance/compliance purposes. Permission is hereby granted for officers from such IEEE Standards Working Group or Committee to reproduce the draft document developed by that Working Group for purposes of international standardization consideration. IEEE Standards Department must be informed of the submission for consideration prior to any reproduction for international standardization consideration (titlecopyright@ieee.org). Prior to adoption of this document, in whole or in part, by another standards development organization, permission must first be obtained from the IEEE Standards Department (titlecopyright@ieee.org). When requesting permission, IEEE Standards Department will require a copy of the standard development organization's document highlighting the use of IEEE content. Other entities seeking permission to reproduce this document, in whole or in part, must also obtain permission from the IEEE Standards Department.

IEEE Standards Department
445 Hoes Lane
Piscataway, NJ 08854, USA

Contents

1. Overview ........................................................................................................................................... 1
   1.1 Scope ........................................................................................................................................... 1
   1.2 Purpose ...................................................................................................................................... 1
   1.3 Word usage ................................................................................................................................. 2

2. Normative references ...................................................................................................................... 2

3. Definitions, acronyms, and abbreviations ...................................................................................... 2
   3.1 Definitions ................................................................................................................................... 2
   3.2 Acronyms and abbreviations ....................................................................................................... 3

4. Ontologies for ethically-aligned robotics and automation systems .............................................. 4
   4.1 Conventions ............................................................................................................................... 4
   4.2 Background .............................................................................................................................. 4
   4.3 Top-level definitions .................................................................................................................... 6
   4.4 ERAS top-level concepts ............................................................................................................ 6
   4.5 Norms and ethical principles ..................................................................................................... 15
   4.6 Data Privacy and Protection ..................................................................................................... 29
   4.7 Transparency and Accountability .............................................................................................. 45
   4.8 Ethical Violation Management ................................................................................................. 56
   4.8.1 Axiom Pattern A for Governments with no capacity ........................................................ 67
   4.8.2 Axiom Pattern B for Governments achieving an evolving capacity ................................ 67

Annex A (informative) Informative definitions ................................................................................... 69
   A.1 Top-level definitions .................................................................................................................... 69
   A.2 Norms and Ethical Principles ..................................................................................................... 70
   A.3 Data Protection and Privacy ....................................................................................................... 75
   A.4 Transparency and accountability ................................................................................................. 81
   A.5 Ethical Violation Management ................................................................................................. 86

Annex B (informative) Ontology development .................................................................................. 89

Annex C (informative) Use cases ......................................................................................................... 91
   C.1 Use Case Template .................................................................................................................... 91
   C.2 Norms and Ethics Use Case: Domestic Personal Assistant Robot ........................................ 92
   C.3 Ethical Violation Management Use Case: Data Privacy and Protection ............................. 94
   C.4 Transparency use case: autonomous system behavior explanation ..................................... 96

Annex D (informative) Distributed Responsibility Ascription for Autonomous Systems ................... 99

Annex E (informative) Bibliography .................................................................................................... 101
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot


IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

Ballot Group : 58

Ballot Group Makeup

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ballot Group</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Other</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Researcher</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17.24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Student</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Teacher</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consulting</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20.68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Interest</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government - Other</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - Component</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - Other</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - Software</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - System / Manufacturer</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Association / Professional Society</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Provider - Design Services</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Provider - Documentation Services</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.72%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

Ballot from April, 12th to May, 13th

Ballot Group Members 58
Minimum should be 10

Return Ballots: Minimum return rate is 75%

Abstentions: Abstentions must be below 30%

Approval Rate: Approval rate must be at least 75%
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

Ballot from April, 12th to May, 13th

Ballot Group Members: 58
Minimum should be 10

Return Ballots: (46) 79%
Minimum return rate is 75%

Abstentions:
Abstentions must be below 30%

Approval Rate:
Approval rate must be at least 75%
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

Ballot from April, 12th to May, 13th

Ballot Group Members: 58
Minimum should be 10

Return Ballots: (46) 79%
Minimum return rate is 75%

Abstentions: (6) 13%
Abstentions must be below 30%

Approval Rate: Approval rate must be at least 75%
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

Ballot from April, 12th to May, 13th

**Ballot Group Members**: 58
Minimum should be 10

**Return Ballots**: (46) 79%
Minimum return rate is 75%

**Abstentions**: (6) 13%
Abstentions must be below 30%

**Approval Rate**: 84%
Approval rate must be at least 75%
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot

Ballot from April, 12th to May, 13th

Ballot Group Members: 58
Minimum should be 10

Return Ballots: (46) 79%
Minimum return rate is 75%

Abstentions: (6) 13%
Abstentions must be below 30%

Approval Rate: 84%
Approval rate must be at least 75%

Votes counted in approval rate:
- Approve: 33
- Disapprove With MBS Comment(s): 6
- Total: 39

Votes not counted in approval rate:
- Disapprove Without MBS Comment(s): 1
- Abstentions: 6
- Total: 7

Total Votes: 46
Total Comments: 83
IEEE 7007 SA Ballot
Disapprovals - Must Be Satisfied Comments

1 Academic Researcher
1 Academic Teacher
1 General Interest
1 Producer - System / Manufacturer
1 Research
1 Service Provider - Documentation Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ballot Group Makeup</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic-Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consulting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government - Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - Component</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - Software</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producer - System / Manufacturer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Association / Professional Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Provider - Design Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Provider - Documentation Services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>