



IEEE-TRO Review Form Preview

[Pdf test](#) [Close](#)

WARNING: Session time out

When the browser does not communicate with the server for 60 minutes the session is terminated for reasons of security and you will need to log in again. Watch the countdown timer to see when the session will expire

Five minutes before time out your work will be automatically saved. Any work done on the page after the autosave will be lost unless you prevent the session from expiring

Use the Save button near the bottom of the page to save your work without submitting it to prevent the session from expiring

Details of the Submission

Title

Authors

Submission number and version

Review requested by

Under review for publication as

Review ID

Reviewer

INSTRUCTIONS FOR REVIEWERS OF SURVEY PAPERS

- **Survey papers** should cover emerging research topics in Robotics and/or have a tutorial or review nature of sufficiently large interest to the Transactions audience. Authors of survey papers have contacted the Editor-in-Chief prior to submission, in order to assess the potential interest of the topic to T-RO.
- Please respect the deadline. As an author, you undoubtedly appreciate the importance of minimizing delays.
- Please provide detailed comments to the authors, including at least a few sentences justifying your recommendation. The following points are suggested for your comments:
 - What is the contribution or originality of the paper **as a survey**?
 - Is the survey complete? If you believe there are items to be added or eliminated, specify which ones.
 - Is the paper clearly written and well organized?
 - Are the references complete and correctly cited in the text? Supply missing references and/or indicate more appropriate ones.
 - If there are technical issues that are not sound, why not?
 - If the paper is too long for its category, how can it be shortened?
 - Do you find the paper of interest to a sufficiently large part of the audience of T-RO?

Supply any information that you think will be useful to the author for a revision, for enhancing the appeal of the survey, or for convincing him/her of the weak points or mistakes. The reviewer's recommendation for acceptance or rejection should not be included in the comments to the author. Do not identify yourself or your organization within the review text.

- In your critical comments to the author, please be specific. If you find that the results are incorrectly cited, please give references to earlier papers which contain these or similar results. If you say that the reasoning is incorrect or vague, please indicate specifically where and why. If you suggest that the paper be rewritten, give specific suggestions as to which parts of the paper should be deleted, amplified or modified, and please indicate how.
- If the paper has a multimedia attachment (typically, a video clip), please evaluate this in the Comments Section. Is it consistent with the paper content? Does it enhance the paper quality? If it is a video, how is its technical quality? Is it free of commercialism?

- Please note the following T-RO policy: If a paper is submitted as Survey, the possible recommendations are restricted only within this paper category. If the paper does not fit well in this category, then it should be rejected.
- The paper review procedure for the IEEE Transactions on Robotics involves a **recommendation** prepared by the Associate Editor on the basis of the paper reviews by peers. The final **decision** on publication, sustaining or modifying this recommendation, is taken by the Editor handling the paper.

RECOMMENDATION SECTION FOR SURVEY PAPERS

*Required field

Overall Recommendation*

Accept as Survey Paper provided that all typographic errors and minor recommendations are corrected in the final version

Conditionally Accept as Survey Paper provided that minor revisions are made as indicated in the Comments Section

Revise and Resubmit as Survey Paper as indicated in the Comments Section (if resubmitted, the revised paper should undergo a full review cycle keeping past review material into account)

Reject as Survey Paper (future submission of this work will be treated as a new paper, independently from the current category)

Submit to Another Journal

Please check if you wish to see the revision ☐

If the paper has a multimedia attachment, should this be included in case of final acceptance? ☐

If you have recommended submission to another journal, please indicate which one

ASSESSMENT/EVALUATION. PLEASE RATE THE PAPER ACCORDING TO THE FOLLOWING CRITERIA:

*Required field

Contribution as a Survey* Originality as a Survey* Completeness as a Survey* Technical Quality* Clarity of Presentation* Full Awareness of the Literature* Adequacy of Citations* Interest to Transactions Audience* **COMMENTS SECTION**

*Required field

**Confidential
Comments to the
Editorial Staff**

Not more than 2000
characters (about 33
full lines)

[Check length](#) [Fit to
size](#)

**Comments to the
Author***

Not more than 9000
characters (about
150 full lines)

[Check length](#) [Fit to
size](#)

Please discuss:

- Major Contribution of the Survey
- Organization and Style
- Technical Accuracy
- Presentation
- Adequacy and Completeness of Citations
- Multimedia (if present)

**Upload an
attachment to the
Comments to the
Author (optional)**

Pdf file of size less
than 1 MB

Use this for including
additional material
(e.g., review with
equations or graphs).
Please mention this
attachment in your
Comments to the
Author.

Browse...

Click on Submit to upload the file
[All pdf information fields are automatically edited
to remove any reference to the author of the document](#)

Save or Submit the Review		
Save the possibly incomplete review to complete and submit it later	Save	Warning: If you save the review then it has not been submitted Any attachment that you try to upload will not be saved Do not forget to return to this page to complete the review and submit it
Send me a copy of the review by e-mail upon submission	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Submit the review	Submit	Warning: Please check the review carefully before submitting it. You will not be able to revise the review after it has been submitted After you have submitted the review, click on the status link of the review in your reviews list to see the reviews that are available for this paper (including your own) and, eventually, the publication decision
		Close

Technical Content © IEEE Robotics & Automation Society



This site is protected by copyright and trademark laws under US and International law.

All rights reserved. © 2002-2007 PaperCept, Inc.

[Terms of use.](#)